

JERZY OSTAPCZUK¹

[HTTPS://ORCID.ORG/0000-0002-7659-3936](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7659-3936)

Cyrillic Early Printed Tetraevangelia issued in Kyiv in 1697 and 1712 – their liturgical tradition and original. Study of saints and feasts present in the menologia²

Cyrylickie stare druki Ewangelii tetr wydane w Kijowie w 1697 i 1712 roku – ich tradycja liturgiczna i oryginał. Analiza świętych i świąt obecnych w menologionach

Keywords: early printed book, Tetraevangelion, Kyiv, 1697, 1712, liturgical tradition, original

Słowa kluczowe: stary druk, Ewangelia tetr, Kijów, 1697, 1712, tradycja liturgiczna oryginal

Summary

Ten Cyrillic early printed liturgical Tetraevangelia published by the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra's printing house can be divided into two groups. The first one comprises two unique editions issued in 1697 and 1712. These first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia were issued after the 1686 annexation of the Metropolitanate of Kyiv by the Moscow Patriarchate. This event resulted in the gradual loss of independence by Kyiv church tradition and bringing censorship of Muscovite authorities over the printing houses run in Kyiv and Chernihiv, fully introduced in 1720. A text-critical study of several Gospel fragments and paratexts (i.e., Prefaces to the Gospels and Lists of Chapter Titles) has

¹ Dr hab. Jerzy Ostapczuk, Faculty of Theology, Christian Theological Academy in Warsaw.

² This article has been written under the research project financed by the National Science Centre (Poland). Decision number: UMO-2020/37/B/HS1/01658.

proven that these first two Kyiv Gospel editions, beside their own textual readings, contain some variants confirmed only in Moscow Tetraevangelia issued in the 2nd half of the 17th century.

The Menologia, always placed at the end in Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia, contain some saints and feasts venerated only locally. These commemorations can help to find originals for printed and handwritten Gospels. The Menologia also shed some light on local liturgical tradition.

This publication focuses on textual variants and liturgical tradition represented by the Menologia of Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia. On their basis the original of the first two Kyiv Gospel editions printed in 1697 and 1712 was found, i.e., Moscow Tetraevangelion issued in 1688. It was also proven that these two Gospel editions reflect some locally venerated saints, omitted not only in all further Kyiv Tetraevangelia but in all other 108 researched sources.

Streszczenie

Dziesięć cyrylickich starych druków liturgicznych Ewangelii tetr wydanych przez Drukarnię Ławry Kijowsko-Peczerskiej można podzielić na dwie grupy. Jedną z nich stanowią dwie wyjątkowe edycje z 1697 i 1712 roku. Te dwie kijowskie Ewangelie ukazały się po aneksji w 1686 roku metropolii kijowskiej przez patriarchat moskiewski. Wydarzenie to skutkowało stopniową utratą tożsamości przez kijowską tradycję liturgiczną i wprowadzeniem w 1720 roku cenzury władz moskiewskich nad drukarniami w Kijowie i Czernihowie. Analiza tekstologiczna kilku fragmentów Ewangelii tetr i paratekstów (tj. Przedmowy do Ewangelii i tytułów ewangelijnych) wskazała, że pierwsze dwie kijowskie Ewangelie, oprócz typowych tylko im wariantów tekstu, zawierają również warianty poświęcone wyłącznie w moskiewskich Ewangeljach tetr z II połowy XVII wieku. Menologiony, które w starych drukach Ewangelii tetr były zawsze umieszczone na końcu, zawierają niekiedy świętych i święta czczonych tylko lokalnie. Wspomnienia te są pomocne w poszukiwaniu oryginałów zarówno drukowanych, jak i pisanych ręcznie Ewangelii. Menologiony przekazują również pewne informacje o lokalnej tradycji liturgicznej. Niniejsza publikacja koncentruje się na wariantach tekstu i tradycji liturgicznej odzwierciedlonej w menologionach cyrylickich starych druków Ewangelii tetr. Były one podstawą do wskazania oryginału pierwszych dwóch kijowskich edycji Ewangelii, tj. moskiewskiego wydania z 1688 roku. Udowodniono również, że te dwie Ewangelie wydrukowane w Kijowie w latach

1697 i 1712 zawierają wspomnienia niektórych lokalnie czczonych świętych, pominiętych nie tylko we wszystkich kolejnych kijowskich edycjach, ale również we wszystkich innych 108 poddanych analizie Ewangeliach tetr.

Text-critical studies of a fragment from the Gospel of Mark, all four Prefaces by the Blessed Theophylact of Bulgaria and short Lives of the Evangelists as well as Lists of Chapter Titles confirmed the unique importance of the first two³ Cyrillic early printed liturgical Tetraevangelia from Kyiv. They were issued in 1697⁴ and 1712 in a workshop run by the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra.⁵ The second Kyiv edition of the liturgical Tetraevangelion⁶ is considered a reprint of the first.⁷

Research results have indicated the similarity between the first two Kyiv Gospel editions and some Moscow Tetraevangelia (Ostapczuk 2019, 121; 2021a, 119; 2021b, 155), especially those printed in the second half of the 17th century, as well as their convergence with the Lviv editions (Ostapczuk 2017a, 367; 2019, 121.125; Kagamlyk 2020, 58).⁸ The first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia contain textual variants not found in

³ A total of ten Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia were published in Kyiv. The eight remaining Kyiv editions were published in 1733, 1737, 1746, 1752, 1759, 1771, 1773 and 1784.

⁴ By the early 18th century, the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra's workshop had printed almost 18 titles (Kaganov 1959, 43). The first Tetraevangelion was not issued in Kyiv until 1697. The first Apostolos was printed in the Lavra's printing house not much earlier than the Gospel, i.e., in 1695 (Titov 1918a, 395-397).

⁵ Printing appeared in Kyiv in the early 17th century (Titov 1918a, 15). In 1606-1614 books were issued occasionally (Titov 1918a, 79-84), the regular activity of the Lavra's printing house dates to 1615 (Titov 1918a, 85-87). The first Kyiv printed publication, the Book of Hours (i.e., Часослов), is dated no earlier than 20 December 1616 (Titov 1918a, 87; Zapasko, Isaevič 1981, no. 109).

⁶ The second Kyiv edition of the Tetraevangelion – like the first one – is also considered unique in terms of typography (Titov 1918a, 434).

⁷ The first two Kyiv Gospel editions were the model for some further Kiev Tetraevangelia, including those issued in 1733, 1746, 1771 and 1773 (Ostapczuk 2019, 116).

⁸ A preliminary analysis of the Preface to the Gospel of Matthew in the Kyiv editions of the New Testament issued in 1658 and 1692 revealed their similarity to the Lviv Gospel editions as well as the similarity of the Kyiv editions of the New Testament printed in 1727, 1732 and 1741 with some Moscow editions (Ostapczuk 2019, 125).

other typologically identical editions, which made it possible to identify them as a separate subgroup (Ostapczuk 2017a, 365.367; 2019, 116).

In a small passage of the Gospel of Mark (1, 1-2, 22)⁹ in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia, the existence of four marginalia explaining the relevant terms and expressions found in the Gospel text and two textual variants have been confirmed.¹⁰ E.g., the text *ѦДЫИ АКРИДЫ И МЕДЪ ДИВИИ* (Mk 1, 6) was supplemented with the expression *зеліе вкоушенію пріатное, дикий лѣсный* in the margin, while for the verb *остави* in Mk 1, 24¹¹ the margin contains the Greek form *ἔα*, which has only been attested in the oldest Kyiv edition of 1697.

The four Prefaces to the Gospels by the Blessed Theophylact of Bulgaria in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia confirm the presence of more textual variants absent in all other Gospel editions (Ostapczuk 2019, 115-126). As an illustration, the following differences found in the first¹² Preface can be pointed to, i.e., *просвѣщахѸ са – наставлахѸ са; самомоу ономоу – самомоу бѣѸ; того хотѣнїа – бжїа хотѣнїа; възрѣвїи на женѸ – іакв всакъ иже возрїтѸ на женѸ; отѸ давида – отѸ авраама и давида; не разликоуютѸ – не различаютѸ* (Ostapczuk 2019, 118).¹³

In the four short Lives of the Evangelists, each about half a page long, the number of textual variants in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia is very small. As an example, the following two can be pointed out: *не вѣдомомѸ по сихѸ вѸ еллинское сїе преложшоу – еже по томѸ вѸ еллинскїи ѡзыкъ преложено быеть; житїи (...) отѸ сѣаго іеронїма – житїи (...) отѸ блжєнїагв іеронїма списанное* (Ostapczuk et al. 2020, 132). These short texts, taken from the work *De viris illustribus* by Blessed Jerome

⁹ The fragment analysed covered just the first nine Gospel pericopes (i.e., *зачало*).

¹⁰ Ostapczuk 2017a, 365; 2019, 116-117. Cf. also Titov 1918b, 506-507.

¹¹ *г҃ла, остави что намѸ и тебѸ.*

¹² The number of textual variants varies from one preface to another, cf. Ostapczuk 2019, 122-125.

¹³ For a list of all variants of the four Prefaces to Gospels, see: Ostapczuk 2019, 119-125.

and translated into Greek by his student Sophronius,¹⁴ were first introduced into Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelion issued in 1657 in Moscow. From then on, they were present in all the Moscow editions and in the editions modelled on them, i.e., in all the Kyiv and Pochaiv¹⁵ Tetraevangelia (Ostapczuk et al. 2020, 129).

The four Lists of Chapter Titles present in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia also confirm a small number of textual variants. For example, the following textual differences in the first List (i.e., to the Gospel of Matthew) can be pointed out: *первыи ѿвѣа проповѣда цр҃тво небесное – о ѿданиѣ пр҃тчи проповѣдавшемъ цр҃тво небесное; о неповелѣннѣмъ въ слѣдъ ити – о хотѣвшемъ въ слѣдъ ити* (Ostapczuk 2020, 213).

The small number of textual variants attested only in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia issued in 1697 and 1712 confirms their unique significance and does not undermine their similarity to the Moscow Gospel editions printed after 1657. The text-critical study of thirteen texts did not make it possible to identify a single Moscow edition, or possibly several editions used by the Kyiv printers to prepare their first Cyrillic early printed liturgical Tetraevangelion issued in 1697, then reprinted in 1712.

The first two Kyiv Gospel editions were published between 1686 and 1720.¹⁶ These dates are of singular importance in the history of the Orthodox Church in the lands of the Eastern Slavs and the development of printing, especially religious, in Ukraine.

¹⁴ The authorship of the short Lives of the Evangelists is usually attributed to Sophronius (cf. Ostapczuk et al. 2020, 128-129).

¹⁵ The 1746 Kiev Gospel edition was used to prepare the first Pochaiv Tetraevangelion issued in 1759 (cf. Ostapczuk 2023a, 10-23). All the Pochaiv Gospel editions were printed in the second half of the 18th century for the use of the Uniate Church.

¹⁶ There was one other liturgical Gospel edition that was published in Kiev between 1686 and 1720 and was typologically different from the Tetraevangelia analysed. It is the only early printed weekday Gospel lectionary (*le*). This edition is also unique in terms of the type used, format and ornamentation (Titov 1918a, 417). It was issued in 1707. On its originals see Ostapczuk 2017b, 425-468.

The Truce of Andrusovo,¹⁷ signed in 1667, divided Ukraine¹⁸ into Right-bank Ukraine, which became part of the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth, and Left-bank Ukraine (including Kyiv), which was subordinated to the Muscovite state. This initiated a series of events that led to the transition of the Kyiv Metropolitanate¹⁹ from the Ecumenical Patriarchate in 1686²⁰ to the jurisdiction of the Muscovite Patriarchate, established in 1589, and thus to the indirect control of the Muscovite tsars (Bendza 2006, 68; Ćwikła 2006, 242-243; Mironowicz 2006, 60-62). This and several other events²¹ also adversely affected the operation of the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra's printing house (Ogiênko 1925, 287). After an unsuccessful attempt to impose censorship, the distribution

¹⁷ Occasionally even the mid-17th century is indicated, e.g., the Pereiaslav Agreement (Bendza 2006, 69; Ćwikła 2006, 238).

¹⁸ This division was sanctioned by the Treaty of Perpetual Peace concluded on 6 May 1686 (cf. Ćwikła 2006, 252).

¹⁹ The subordination of the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra to the Patriarch of Moscow also entailed the necessity of printing the names of the reigning Tsar and the incumbent Patriarch on title pages (Titov 1918a, 376.446; Ogiênko 1925, 289; Kagamlyk 2020, 57). This fact is attested to as early as the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia, where the following information is given on the title pages, i.e. (...) за бл҃гополѣчѣныа державы, пресвѣтлѣшиоу и державнѣшиоу, великоу гдѣра нашеу црѣ и великоу кнѣза, петра алеѣѣвича, всеа великѣа, и малыа, и бѣлыа росси самодержца. в стѣи, великоу, члѣдотворноу, киевпечерскоу лаврѣ, старуопигнѣи великоу гдѣна, стѣшиоу кнѣ адриана архїеїпа москѣскоу и всеа росси и всеѣ сѣверныѣ страѣ патрїархи (...) – in the first Gospel edition, and (...) за бл҃гополѣчѣныа державы, пресвѣтлѣшиагѣ и державнѣшѣоу, великагѣ гдѣра нашеу црѣ и великагѣ кнѣза, петра алеѣѣвича, всеа великѣа, и малыа, и бѣлыа росси самодержца. при бл҃городномѣ црѣвичѣ и великомѣ кнѣзѣ алеѣїи петровичѣ, в стѣи, великоу, члѣдотворноу, киевпечерскоу лаврѣ, междѣ патрїаршествомѣ, бл҃венїемѣ пренїценнагѣ собора при архїмаѣдритѣ печѣскоу, всеѣтнѣоу ѿцѣ аданасїи (...) – in the second one.

²⁰ On 8 November 1685, Metropolitan Gedeon Chetvertinsky (1634-1690) was the first Metropolitan of Kyiv to receive the title from the Patriarch of Moscow (cf. Bendza 2006, 110-111; Mironowicz 2008, 61).

²¹ The Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra was at first briefly subordinated to the Metropolitan of Kyiv and later, through the efforts of Archimandrite Barlaam Iasins'kyi in 1688, directly to the Patriarch of Moscow (Ogiênko 1925, 287-288). Thus, when he was abbot of the Lavra (1684-1690) the only books coming out of its printing house were ones about which Moscow could have no doubts (Titov 1918a, 376-377).

and sale of Kyiv books that were not reprints of Moscow editions were banned in Russia, clearly affecting the publishing profile of the Lavra's printing house (Ogiênko 1925, 290-291; Isaevič 2002, 249).²² All these events initiated the loss of liturgical differentiation between the Kyiv Metropolitanate and the Muscovite tradition developed in the 1650s and 1660s (Âremenko 2017, 11).

The centralizing policy of Tsar Peter I²³ and efforts at unification (Isaevič 2002, 250-251) led to the issuing of a decree on 5 October 1720 by which the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra's printing house and others were completely stripped of their independence (Ogiênko 1925, 298-299; Subtelny 1980, 14). The Most Holy Governing Synod²⁴ also issued corresponding orders in 1721 (Titov 1918a, 449; Ogiênko 1925, 299-300). From that moment on,²⁵ every publication prepared by the Kyiv publishing house had to be reviewed in Moscow and approved there for printing and distribution (Isaevič 2002, 249-263; Ogiênko 1925, 300; Âremenko 2017, 18; Kagamlyk 2020, 55-57). Kyiv editions were checked for conformity with the unified editions of the Moscow Synodal Typography (Âremenko 2017, 22).²⁶ Both content and language were revised (Isaevič 2002, 252). Despite painstaking efforts, the Lavra's printing house never regained its independence again (Kagamlyk 2020, 54-64).

²² In the 1690s, the Lavra's printing house predominantly issued liturgical books (Titov 1918a, 391-393).

²³ His reforms fundamentally changed relations between Kyiv and Moscow, cf. Subtelny 1980, 1-17.

²⁴ After the death of Patriarch Adrian of Moscow in 1700, Peter I did not allow the election of another patriarch. The Tsar only appointed a temporary administrator in the person of Metropolitan Stephen of Ryazan. On 25 January 1721, he abolished the Patriarchate and appointed a governing body of the Church, the Most Holy Governing Synod, headed by a Chief Procurator (Ober-Prokuror).

²⁵ On the night of 21-22 April 1718, the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra and its printing house suffered great losses due to a fire. The workshop only resumed its activities in 1720 (Ogiênko 1925, 292).

²⁶ On the unification of liturgical books printed in Synodal Typography in Moscow, see Âremenko 2017, 26-27.

These two historical events left their mark on books printed in Kyiv after 1686 and 1720. While the former date merely initiated the influence of the Muscovite tradition on the Kyivan tradition (Ogiênko 1925, 287-291), the latter contributed to the complete domination of the former over the latter (Titov 1918a, 468-470; Ogiênko 1925, 300). In view of this information, one can predict the results of a text-critical study of thirteen texts of 110 Cyrillic early printed liturgical Tetraevangelia demonstrating not only the similarity of the first two Kyiv Gospel editions with the Moscow ones from the second half of the 17th century, but also the differences. The numerous commemorations of saints and feasts occurring only in the first two Kyiv Gospel editions issued in 1697 and 1712 attest that Kyiv still preserved a local liturgical tradition (Ogiênko 1925, 287) and was relatively independent from Moscow. Saints of non-Kyiv and non-Pechersk origin, present in the first two Kyiv Gospel editions, no longer appeared in the eight further Tetraevangelia printed in Kyiv after 1720. Only the commemorations of saints directly linked to the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra were not removed from the last eight Kyiv Tetraevangelia.

Among the saints appearing in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia issued in 1697 and 1712, and absent from all the other 108 editions analysed, eight figures should be mentioned: Gleb, prince of Russia (5 September);²⁷ Theodulus, Eparch of Constantinople (3 December);²⁸ Arsenius of Mount Latra (13 December);²⁹ Macarius of Alexandria (19 January);³⁰ Photini, the Samaritan Woman (20 March);³¹ Empress Pulcheria (7 August);³² Eleutherius and Leonidas of Constantinople

²⁷ оубиеніє свѣтаго глѣба княза рѣ.

²⁸ деодоула бывшаго епарха константина града.

²⁹ преподобнаго отьца нашего арсениа иже въ латрѣ.

³⁰ макариа александриискаго.

³¹ свѣтъна мученицы фотинии самаряныни. Her commemoration is confirmed in only one Moscow Tetraevangelion printed in 1681.

³² сѣтъна благоверныа царици пѣлхерии.

(8 August).³³ The first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia printed in 1697 and 1712 also contain a significant number of Kyiv and Pechersk saints – as many as 22 commemorations.³⁴ These 22 saints appeared in the oldest Kyiv Gospel edition³⁵ for the first time.³⁶

The first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia also contain a great number of unusual liturgical or historical information, unknown to other typologically identical editions. Examples include:

- providing information on the dedication of the Gospel readings, e.g., *МЪЧЕНИКЪ* (2 September); *СВЯЦЕННОМЪЧЕНИКЪ* (3, 4 and 7 September); *СВАТЪБИ МЪЧЕНИЦЪ* (28 October); *СВАТИТЕЛЮ* (20 November),
- – adding information on the Gospel pericopes for the Orthros on the Feast of the Apostle James, the Lord's brother (23 October);³⁷ Great Martyr Barbara and John of Damascus (4 December),³⁸

³³ *СВАТЪХЪ МЪЧЕНИКЪ ЕЛЕУДЕРНА И ЛЕОНИДА.*

³⁴ Among them are Nicholas Svyatosha, Prince of Chernigov (14 October); Spyridon and Nicodemus (31 October); Athanasius (2 December); Nikon (11 December); Gregory (8 January); Lawrence (29 January); Prochorus (10 February); Isaac (14 February); Erasmus (24 February); Eustracius (28 March); Nikita (14 May); Metropolitans Cyprian, Photius and Jonah (27 May); Agapetus (1 June); John (18 July); Moses (26 July); Pimen (7 August); Basil and Theodore (11 August); Alypius the Iconographer (17 August).

³⁵ With only one exception, their presence is also confirmed in all subsequent Kyiv Gospel editions. The reference to Metropolitans Cyprian, Photius and Jonah (27 May) occurs only in four, out of eight, Kyiv Tetraevangelia printed after 1720, i.e., in 1733, 1746, 1752 and 1759.

³⁶ Commemorations of some Pechersk saints were also introduced in later Kyiv Tetraevangelia. Nine new Pechersk saints were introduced into the 1733 Gospel edition (Damian, Jeremiah, and Matthew {5 October}; Arethas {24 October}; Anastasius the deacon {22 January}; Titus {27 February}; Nikon the Igumen {23 March}; Nifont, bishop of Novgorod {8 April}; Isaiah {15 May}) and Euphrosyne, princess of Polotsk (23 May), whose relic was in the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra. Only two new saints were introduced into the Kiev Tetraevangelion printed in 1784, i.e., Kuksha and Pimen (27 August).

³⁷ *НА ѸТРЕНИИ. ЕВѢЛІЕ ОТЬ ЛѢКИ ЗАЧАЛО ЊА.* All Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia on 23 October contain information only on the Gospel pericope for the Divine Liturgy (*НА ЛИТЪРГИИ. ЕВѢЛІЕ ОТЬ МАТЪВЕА ЗАЧАЛО ЊС.*).

³⁸ *НА ОУТРЕНИИ ЕВѢЛІЕ ОТЬ МАРКА ЗАЧАЛО ЪА І НА ЛИТУРГИИ ЕВѢЛІЕ ОТЬ МАТЪВЕА ЗАЧАЛО*

- indicating the commemoration of John Cassian (29 February) in a leap year,³⁹
- adding information on Nicholas Svyatosha, Prince of Chernigov (14 October): grandson of Davyd Svyatoslavich (ok. 1050-1123), brother of Vladimir and Iziaslav, who died after 30⁴⁰ years and was buried in the Lavra,⁴¹
- referring to Barlaam and Josaphat, prince of India (19 November), as hermits,⁴²
- retaining the designation “of Kyiv” in the mention of Metropolitan Peter (21 December) instead of “of Moscow”,⁴³
- providing additional information on the martyrdom of Basil and Theodore of the Caves (11 August): about their tormentor (Prince Mstislav Svyatopolkovich) as well as the place of (Kyiv) and reason for their martyrdom (wealth),⁴⁴
- adding information about Anthony of the Caves (10 July) as the superior of all monks in Rus,⁴⁵

řs. Only one Kiev Tetraevangelion and the five Uniate editions, modelled on it, give the Gospel pericopes of Orthros and Divine Liturgy (на оутрении еѿліе отъ матрѣа зачало рѣд. на литоургии еѿліе отъ матрѣа зачало ѿс). In the Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia for the Divine Liturgy on 4 December, the following Gospel pericopes (зачало) were also provided: Mt 104 and 43 as well as Mk 21.

³⁹ I.e., въ лѣто четвертое егда висектъ бываетъ, тогда кѣд составляетъ са и касианѣ слѣжба поетъ са.

⁴⁰ Saint Nicholas Svyatosha was born in 1080, joined the Lavra in Kyiv in 1107 and died in 1143.

⁴¹ княза николаы, нарицаемаго стоши, внѣка сватославова, брата владимирова и сватославова иже по лѣтѣхъ прѣстави са и погребенъ быстъ чѣстно въ пещерьѣ киевскои.

⁴² преподобныхъ пѣстынножителен варлаама и ивасафа, царевича великина индии.

⁴³ прѣставление въ сватѣхъ ѿца нашего петра митрополита киевскаго и всеа рѣссии чюдотворца. In other editions it is referred to as: митрополита новаго чюдотворца всеа рѣссии ѿ митрополита московскаго чюдотворца и всеа рѣссии (ог рѣссии) чюдотворца.

⁴⁴ пострадавшихъ въ киевѣ отъ княза мстислава сватополчина сокровища ради.

⁴⁵ преподобнаго оца нашего антонина печерскаго киевскаго бывшаго начальника всеѣмъ росскимъ монахомъ.

In the Lviv Tetraevangelia and the last Vilnius edition (which is a reprint of the 1636 Lviv edition) on this date, the following information is given при дванаго ѿца нашего

- referring to Theodosius of the Caves (14 August) as the abbot of the Monastery of the Caves in Kyiv,⁴⁶
- adding to the commemoration of Anthony of Rome (17 January) information about his connection with Novgorod,⁴⁷
- adding to the commemoration of Gregory the Theologian (25 January)⁴⁸ and John Chrysostom (27 January)⁴⁹ information about their connection with Constantinople.⁵⁰

The presence of saints and additional liturgical and historical information specific only to the first two Kyiv Gospel editions issued in 1697 and 1712 confirms that it is justified to separate them from all 110 Cyrillic early printed liturgical Tetraevangelia into a separate textual and liturgical subgroup. Claims of the absolute loss of liturgical Kyiv's independence as early as 1686 (Âremenko 2017, 20) should be considered unfounded.

The information presented so far, taken from the Menologion, did not allow to identify a particular edition as the original or several editions as the originals of the first Kyiv Gospel edition issued in 1697, reprinted in 1712. The commemoration of Saint Photini, the Samaritan Woman in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia and only in the Moscow edition of 1681 is a coincidence. This is evidenced by several other commemorations

АНТОНІЯ ВЕЛИКАГО ПЕРВОУЧАНИКА ПЕЧЕРСКАГО МОНАСТЫРЯ ИЖЕ ВЪ КІЕВѢ.

⁴⁶ пренесение чѣстныѣхъ мощей преподобнаго ѿца нашоу деодосіа игѣмена монастыря печерскаго кіевскаго. In the other Kiev Tetraevangelia and the Pochaiv editions (modelled on the Kiev Tetraevangelion of 1746), it is only (...) деодосіа игѣмена печерскаго. The Lviv Tetraevangelia feature the expression (...) деодосіа печерскаго иже въ кіевѢ.

⁴⁷ преподобнаго ѿца нашего антоніа римлянина новгородскаго чюдотворца.

⁴⁸ ѿца нашего григоріа богослова архієпископа константина града.

⁴⁹ пренесение чѣстныѣхъ мощей въ свѣтлыѣхъ ѿца нашего іоанна златоустаго патріарха цѣр҃аграда.

⁵⁰ In the commemoration of Archbishop Tarasius (25 February), the expression архієпископа цѣр҃аграда is attested in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia, while all other Gospel editions (except the three from Kyiv issued in 1737, 1752 and 1759, in which these words are omitted) contain архієпископа константина града.

(e.g., Alexander of Pydna {14 March},⁵¹ Elisabeth {24 April},⁵² Helladius {28 May},⁵³ or the Don Icon of the Mother of God {19 August})⁵⁴ as well as historical information⁵⁵ unattested in any other Gospel edition, except this one Moscow Tetraevangelion of 1681. It is well known that the publishers subjected the forthcoming publications to a greater or lesser degree of revision.⁵⁶

The liturgical and text-critical analysis of both the Menologia of Cyrillic early printed and handwritten Tetraevangelia offers many research perspectives. It makes it possible to confirm or reject various hypotheses. It has made it possible to identify the originals of several handwritten codices (Ostapczuk 2022a, 373-396; 2022c, 181-197) and three early printed Gospel editions, i.e., the Vilnius editions of 1575 and 1644 (Ostapczuk 2023b; Ostapczuk 2023c, 116-146) and the Pochaiv edition of 1759 (Ostapczuk 2023a, 10-23).

In addition to characterising the local liturgical tradition reflected in the Menologia of the first two Kyiv Gospel editions, the aim of this publication is also to attempt to identify, based on an analysis of saints and feasts, the original (or originals) of the first Kyiv Tetraevangelion issued in 1697, reprinted in 1712.

The first two Kyiv liturgical Gospel editions, like all Moscow ones printed after 1652, feature a full Menologion.⁵⁷ A text-critical and liturgical analysis of the feasts and saints confirmed the dependence of

⁵¹ СВАТАГО МОУЧЕНИКА АЛЕΞΑΝΔΡΑ ИЖЕ ВЪ ПΥΔΝΗ.

⁵² ПРЕПОДОБНЫЯ ЕЛИСАВЕТЪИ ЧЮДОТВОРИЦЫ.

⁵³ СВАТАГО СВАЩЕННОМОУЧЕНИКА ЕΛΛΑΔΗΝΑ.

⁵⁴ ПРАЗДНУЕМЪ ПРЕСВАТЪИ БОГОРОДИЦЪ. И БЫВАЕТЪ СЪ ЧЕСТНЫМИ КРЕСТЫ И СО СВАТЫМИ ИКОНАМИ ХОЖДЕНИЕ СОВОРНОЕ ВО ОБИТЕЛЪ ЕЯ НАРИЦАЕМОЮ ДОНСКОЮ.

⁵⁵ The name of Feast of the Deposition of Holy Cincture of the Mother of God (31 August: положеніе ч^{тв}наго пояса пр^тына вл^ци ш^ена в^ци) was supplemented by the following text в^з халкопратни принесеноу отъ епископии зилы в^з цесарствоующии градъ.

⁵⁶ As an example, we can point to the revisions of the Akathists, cf. Popov 2013.

⁵⁷ For more about abbreviated and full menologia in Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia, see Ostapczuk 2022b, 41-48.

the Kyiv editions of 1697 and 1712 on the Moscow Tetraevangelia with a full Menologion, the first of which appeared in 1653. This is evidenced by numerous examples. In April alone, we can point to as many as 23 commemorations of saints⁵⁸ present in all the Moscow Tetraevangelia printed after 1653 and in the first two Kyiv Gospels. Furthermore, in the commemoration of St Euthymius of Suzdal (1 April) in the Moscow Gospel editions printed after 1652 – unlike those of 1637-1651⁵⁹ – the noun *преставление*, as in the first two Kyiv editions, was omitted. This evidence, limited only to examples taken from one month, confirms that the Kyiv printers used one of the Moscow Tetraevangelion issued between 1653⁶⁰ and 1694, i.e., from 1653, 1657, 1663, 1668, 1677, 1681, 1685, 1688, 1689 or 1694. For the preparation of the Kyiv Gospel edition, completed in December 1697, it was impossible to use the Moscow Tetraevangelion, released in September 1697. The too short period between these two editions, the information given on the title page of

⁵⁸ I.e. Titus the Miracle-Worker (2 April); Nikita the Confessor (3 April); Joseph the Hymnographer and George of Mount Maleon (4 April); Theodulus the Reader and Martyr Agathopodes the Deacon (5 April); Eutyches, Archbishop of Constantinople (6 April); George the Confessor, Bishop of Mytilene (7 April); Apostles Hierodion, Agabus, Rufus and others (8 April); Martyr Eupychius (9 April); Martyrs Terence and Pompeius (10 April); Antipas, Bishop of Pergamon (11 April); Basil the Confessor, Bishop of Parium (12 April); Artemon of Laodicea, (13 April); Aristarchus, Pud and Trofim (15 April); Irene, Agape and Chionia (16 April); John, monk and disciple of St Gregory of Dekapolis (18 April); John the Presbyteros of the Ancient Caves ((19 April); Theodore Trichinas (20 April); Martyr Januarius (21 April); Martyr Sabbas Stratelates (24 April); Jason and Sosipater (28 April); Maximus, Dada and Quinctilian (28 April); the Nine Martyrs at Cyzicus (29 April); Memnon the Wonderworker (29 April).

⁵⁹ In the Moscow editions of the Gospels of 1637-1651, the commemoration of this saint was as follows: *преставление преподобнаго ѿца нашего евдимиа соуздальскаго чюдотворца*.

⁶⁰ Until 1697, when the Tetraevangelion was first printed in Kyiv, this type of book had been printed as many as 44 times. Twelve editions appeared in the Serbian and Middle Bulgarian recensions of the Church Slavonic language in Serbian and Romanian lands. The remaining 32 editions in the Eastern Slavonic recension of the Church Slavonic language were printed in Moscow (23 editions), Vilnius (4 editions) and Lviv (5 editions).

the Kyiv Tetraevangelion (Ogiênko 1925, 291)⁶¹ and the historical facts⁶² exclude this possibility.

The publication in 1653 in Moscow of the first Tetraevangelion featuring a full Menologion did not stop the interference of church authorities in the ever-changing liturgical calendar. During the turbulent 1650s and throughout the second half of the 17th century, new, i.e., previously absent, saints and feasts were added or removed.

Some saints commemorated in the Menologion of the Moscow Tetraevangelion in 1653 appeared in several further editions. St Nikita the Presbyter (4 May)⁶³ and St Barbaros (6 May)⁶⁴ were only present in the Moscow Tetraevangelia printed from 1653 to 1681.⁶⁵ Starting from the Moscow edition of 1685, they disappear irretrievably from the Menologia of the Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia. Nor are they mentioned in the first two Kyiv Gospel editions. These facts and the information presented above – concerning only the commemoration of St Alexander of Pydna (14 March), St Elizabeth (24 April), St Helladius (28 May) or the feast of Don Icon of the Mother of God (19 August), present only in the 1681 Moscow edition, dismiss the possibility that the printers in Kyiv might have used the pre-1681 Moscow editions.

⁶¹ The title page of the Kyiv Tetraevangelion mentions the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra's archimandrite Meletius Vuyakevich (при архимандритѣ пещерскоу всечтѣномъ гдѣнѣ ѿца мелегии), who died on 6 February 1697 (Titov 1918a, 395.402).

⁶² After Meletius Vuyakevich, Yoasaf Krokovsky was elected as Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra's archimandrite on 25 March 1697 (Titov 1918a, 402). He became archimandrite only on 29 July 1697 (Titov 1918a, 398).

⁶³ прѣподовнаго ѿца нашего никиты презвитера.

⁶⁴ святаго страстотерпца варвара иже бѣ разбойникъ.

⁶⁵ So only in six Tetraevangelia (i.e., the editions of 1653, 1657, 1663, 1668, 1677 and 1681) out of a total of 110.

Numerous commemorations of saints⁶⁶ and textual variations⁶⁷ attested only in the four Moscow editions of 1681, 1685, 1688 and 1694 and in the first two⁶⁸ Kyiv Tetraevangelia also exclude the 1689 edition as a potential model for Kyiv printers.

The 1689 Moscow Gospel is considered an exceptional edition (Morozov 2012, 53). A mere 150 copies were printed (Zernova 1958, 119). In terms of size, it is the largest 17th-century Moscow Gospel edition. To use this unique Moscow Tetraevangelion, with a small print run and huge dimensions reaching 70cm by 50cm,⁶⁹ would undoubtedly

⁶⁶ Among the commemorations present only in the four Moscow editions of 1681, 1685, 1688 and 1694, and in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia issued in 1697 and 1712 the following ones can be enumerated: Prophet Jonah (22 September), Jonah the Priest, father of St Theophanes, the Hymnographer (22 September); Andronicus and Athanasia (9 October); end of the Feast of the Entry of the Most Holy Theotokos into the Temple (25 November); Pre-Feast of the Nativity of Christ (21, 23 and 24 December); end of the Feast of the Nativity of Christ (31 December); Pre-Festive Days of the Theophany (3 and 5 January); end of the Feast of the Theophany (14 January); end of the Feast of the Presentation of Jesus at the Temple (9 February); commemoration of many others martyred on the feast day of Mark, Bishop of Arethusa, and Cyril the Deacon (29 March); Achatius Martyr (7 May); another Justin – next to Justin the Philosopher (1 June); Stephen the Sabaite (13 July) Phocas (22 July); Olympias and Eupraxia (25 July), end of the Feast Of the Transfiguration of Jesus (13 August); end of the Feast Of the Dormition of the Theotokos (23 August).

⁶⁷ Among the textual variants attested only in the four Moscow Gospel editions issued in 1681, 1685, 1688 and 1694, and in the first two Kiev Tetraevangelia of 1697 and 1712, we can identify:

– the commemoration of Theophanes (11 October) as the Branded, i.e., *НАЧЕРТАННАГО* (and not as the Confessor, i.e., *ИПОВЪДНИКА*); this variant was not attested in the Moscow edition of 1694,

– the commemoration of Cosmas (12 October) as the Hymnographer and the Bishop of Maiuma,

– the commemoration of Maxim, fool for Christ (11 November) as Moscow miracle-worker, this variant is also attested in three Kiev editions of 1737, 1752 and 1759,

– pointing to Emperor Julian the Apostate, under whom Mark, Bishop of Arethusa, and Cyril, the Deacon, and many others were martyred (29 March).

⁶⁸ These commemorations were also attested to in three small format Kyiv Tetraevangelia printed in 1737, 1752 and 1759.

⁶⁹ For more on this edition, cf. Zernova 1958, 119-120 (no. 419); Polovnykova,

have not been an appropriate choice of the Kyiv printers,⁷⁰ especially if they wanted to prepare an edition in half the format, i.e., 2o, to which the first two Kyiv editions correspond. It is also the only edition out of 110 Cyrillic early printed Tetraevangelia that does not include the Lists of Gospel Titles (Ostapczuk 2021b, 145 {Footnote no. 10}). Also, as the only one of the Moscow Gospel editions from 1653-1694, its Menologion does not mention several saints (e.g., Euthymios the New of Thessalonica {15 October}⁷¹) present in the first two Kyiv editions issued in 1697 and 1712. Some of the textual variants attested in this 1689 Moscow Tetraevangelion (e.g., in the commemoration of St. Leontius, Bishop of Rostov {23 May})⁷² are not present in any of the Moscow Gospel editions printed before 1697 nor in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia.⁷³

In the light of the presented above evidence, only the three Moscow editions of 1685, 1688 and 1694 should be regarded as potential originals of the Kyiv Tetraevangelion issued in 1697.⁷⁴ This conclusion is supported by the numerous commemorations and textual variants

Sytyj 1998, 87-89 (no. 122-123); Żurawińska, Jaroszewicz-Pieresławcew 2004, 151-152 (no. 161); Ūrina 2005, 77-79 (no. 110-113).

The copy O. Morozov studied, stored in the Library Museum of the Nizhyn Gogol State University, weighs 17.5 kg (Morozov 2012, 53).

⁷⁰ For a second time such a large-format Tetraevangelion was printed in Moscow in 1759 in 600 copies. Preparation of this Gospel edition began on 25 June 1756 and was completed on 6 February 1759. For more on this edition, see: Guseva 2010, 104-105 (no. 305).

⁷¹ ПРЕПОДОБНАГО ѠЦА НАШЕГО ЕВДИМИА НОВАГО.

⁷² СВАТАГО ЛЕОНТИА ЕПИСКОПА РОСТОВСКАГО.

⁷³ ОБРЪТЕНИЕ ЧЕСТНЫХЪ МОЩЕЙ (ИЖЕ) ВО СВАТЫХЪ ѠЦА НАШЕГО ЛЕОНТИА ЕПИСКОПА РОСТОВСКАГО ЧЮДОТВОРЦА. The commemoration of Leontius Bishop of Rostov in this form is attested by all the Moscow Gospel editions of 1637-1697, except for one from 1689.

⁷⁴ The commemoration on 1 September of Aitala the Martyr and Deacon, Holy 40 Virgin-Martyrs, and their teacher Ammon the Deacon as well as Callista the Martyr and her brothers Evodus and Hermogenes present only in the three Moscow editions issued in 1685, 1688 and 1694 was not included in the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia.

attested exclusively in these three Moscow⁷⁵ and the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia.⁷⁶ As an example, several commemorations can be pointed out: Andrew the Fool for Christ of Constantinople (2 October); the Seven Youths of Ephesus (22 October); Theoktiste of Lesbos (9 November); Irinarchos (28 November); Acacius of Constantinople (29 November); Lucia of Syracuse (13 December); Martyr Euthymius bishop of Sardis (26 December); Marcianus, presbyter and oeconomus of the Great Church of Constantinople (10 January); Martyr Neophyte (21 January); Martyrs Eugene, Valerian, Candidus and Aquila (21 January); Prophet Ezekiel (21 July). Among textual variants attested only in the three Moscow Tetraevangelia issued in 1685, 1688 and 1694 and the first two Kyiv Gospel editions⁷⁷ we can identify the following:

- describing certain saints as: a) miracle-worker (e.g. Joseph Volsky {9 September}; Jonah, Archbishop of Novgorod {5 November}; Michael and Theodore, sons of Prince Constantine

⁷⁵ Many of the commemorations that were introduced into the 1685 Moscow Gospel edition were also attested in later Moscow, Kiev and often Pochaiv Tetraevangelia. For example, the following: Paul of Latrus (15 December); Papis the Martyr (16 March); Acathius, Bishop of Melitene (17 April). This also applies to a number of textual variants, e.g., the indication of the name received at baptism (Gabriel) by Prince Vsevolod (11 February); the indication of the exact number of persons, i.e., seven, martyred together with Agapitus (15 March); the indication of 200, rather than 199, disciples martyred together with Nikon (23 March); omission of information that John (19 April) was a presbyter; omission of the Slavic translation (РЕКШЕ ВЛАСНАГО) in the description of Theodore Trychina (20 April); omission of information that Januarius (21 April) was a bishop; omission of information about the origin of Pelagia (4 May) from Antioch or Tarsus; mention of the name received at baptism (Helena) by Princess Olga (11 July).

Also noteworthy are the omissions of various commemorations in the Moscow Gospel of 1685, also absent in later Moscow, Kiev and often Pochaiv editions. The following omissions can be mentioned as examples: those martyred together with Artemon the Martyr (13 April); Vilnius martyrs Anthony, John, and Eustathius (14 April); Princes Boris and Gleb (2 May).

⁷⁶ Some of these mentions and variants were also attested in three small-format Kiev Tetraevangelia printed in 1737, 1752 and 1759.

⁷⁷ These variants were also attested in the three small-format Kiev Tetraevangelia printed in 1737, 1752 and 1759.

- {21 May}); b) wonderworker of Novgorod (e.g. James of Borovich⁷⁸ {23 October}; Barlaam of Khutyn {6 November}); c) new miracle-worker (Anthony of the Syia Monastery {7 December}), d) blessed (John of Ustiug {29 May}), e) or even miracle-worker and archimandrite (Abraham of Smolensk {21 August}),
- describing saint Marcel (29 December) as the abbot of the monastery of “non-sleepers”,
 - failing to describe prophet Zechariah (8 February) as *Sickle-Seer* (i.e., *серповидца*),⁷⁹
 - referring to Simeon Stylites the Younger (mentioned on the feast day of his mother Martha {4 July}) not as a miracle worker, but as Simon “from the admirable mountain”,
 - providing information that George the New (25 May) was martyred by the Turkish Sultan Selim,
 - specifying the exact number of persons, i.e., 2593, martyred together with the martyr Andrew Stratelates (19 August).

Also noteworthy in this context is the omission of certain commemorations in the three Moscow Gospel editions issued in 1685, 1688 and 1694 and the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia. For example, the consecration of the Church of St. George in Kyiv at the Golden Gate (26 November),⁸⁰ Prince Yuri (George) of Vladimir (4 February),⁸¹ those martyred with Martyr Patricius, Bishop of Prusa (19 June).

Based on the commemorations of saints and feasts, as well as textual variants and liturgical information absent from the two Moscow Tetraevangelia of 1685 and 1688 and the first two Kyiv Gospels, but present in the 1694 edition printed in Moscow, it is possible to exclude this Tetraevangelion as a potential original used by the Kyiv printers. Examples of

⁷⁸ In the Moscow edition of 1694, instead of *новгородскаго* there is *новаго*.

⁷⁹ This term was confirmed only in the Moscow Gospel edition printed in 1681.

⁸⁰ This commemoration was also omitted from the Moscow edition of 1697.

⁸¹ This commemoration was also omitted from the Moscow editions printed in 1689 and 1697 but is present in the 1694 edition.

such commemorations include Gregory, the Miracle-Worker of Vologda (30 September);⁸² Arsenius, Bishop of Tver (2 March),⁸³ or the Tikhvin icon of the Mother of God.⁸⁴ Examples of textual variants include:

- referring to Martyr Babylas (4 September) as Bishop of Antioch,⁸⁵
- omitting designation the Hymnographer⁸⁶ in the commemoration of Theophanes (11 October),
- referring to Stephen, Bishop of Sourozh (15 December), as the Confessor,
- referring to Mikhail Klopsky (11 January) and Ephraim (16 May)⁸⁷ as Novgorod miracle-workers,
- omitting designation the Miracle-Worker of Vladimir⁸⁸ in the commemoration of Prince Yuri (4 February),
- replacing, in the description of the feast of Ignatius, Bishop of Rostov (28 May), the noun *death* by the word *commemoration*,
- referring to Metropolitan Jonah (15 June) as “of Moscow” instead of Kyiv.⁸⁹

⁸² This commemoration appears in all Moscow Gospel editions starting with the one printed in 1698 and Kiev Tetraevangelia issued from 1733 onwards.

⁸³ This commemoration appears in all Moscow Gospel editions starting with the one printed in 1697 and Kiev Tetraevangelia printed from 1733 onwards.

⁸⁴ Only four Moscow Tetraevangelia from the 17th century have this feast, these are the Gospel editions printed in 1677, 1681, 1694 and 1698.

⁸⁵ Only in the two Lviv Gospel editions prepared by Mykhailo Slozka he is identified as Archbishop.

⁸⁶ It was attested in the Bulgarian-Romanian Tetraevangelia of the second half of the 16th century.

⁸⁷ This variant was also attested in three Kiev Gospel editions of 1737, 1752 and 1759.

⁸⁸ It is absent from the Moscow Tetraevangelia from 1698 onwards and the Kyiv Gospel editions printed after 1733.

⁸⁹ It is the only Moscow Tetraevangelion from the 17th century containing this variant. In the 18th century, 18 editions were printed in Moscow with this variant.

As far as liturgical information is concerned, the following examples can be given:

- providing *prokimenena* and *sticheria* as well as liturgical pericopes for Orthros and Divine Liturgy⁹⁰ on the feasts of different saints, e.g., Barlaam (19 November),⁹¹ Arsenius, Bishop of Tver (2 March),⁹² etc.,
- providing a type of service (служба преподобническаѧ)⁹³ on the feast day of Job the Long-Suffering (6 May) instead of the Gospel pericopes for the Divine Liturgy.

This conclusion is also supported by the few saints omitted from the 1694 Moscow edition, but present only in the 1685 and 1688 Moscow Gospel editions and the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia. Examples include Lampadius of Hierapolis (5 July)⁹⁴ and Nicholas Kochanov, a Novgorod Fool for Christ and miracle-worker (27 July).

The commemorations of saints and feasts presented above, as well as the textual variants and liturgical information, allow us to exclude the Moscow Gospel edition printed 1694 and as a potential original the first Kyiv Tetraevangelion issued in 1697, subsequently reprinted in 1712.

Thus, by way of elimination, from the group of 10 Moscow Gospel editions printed in the second half of the 17th century, two remain: the first of 1685 and the second of 1688, which should be regarded as potential originals of the first two Kyiv editions.

⁹⁰ Most of the other Gospel editions only gave the following information: служба свѣтительская.

⁹¹ In other Tetraevangelia, if information was included, only the Gospel pericopes for Orthros and Divine Liturgy were indicated.

⁹² I.e., на оутрении прокименъ. свѣщенницы твои возрадоуютъ са въ правдоу и преподобнии твои возрадоуютъ са. стихъ. помани господи давида и всю кротостъ его. евангелие иуанна. зачало ѡс. на литургии. евангелие матвѣе зачало. ѡи. отъ полъ.

⁹³ In the three Kiev Gospel editions of 1737, 1752 and 1759 the following information was printed: служба преподобныхъ.

⁹⁴ This mention is also present in the Moscow Tetraevangelion of 1681.

However, it is highly probable that it was the 1688 Moscow Gospel edition that was the original of the Kyiv Tetraevangelion printed in 1697 and reprinted in 1712. Such a claim is based on only one commemoration. The veneration of Dometian, Bishop of Melitene (10 January), introduced into the Moscow Gospel edition of 1681, was omitted from the next Moscow Tetraevangelion issued in 1685, but included in the next edition of 1688⁹⁵ and reprinted in the first two Kyiv ones⁹⁶ in the precisely identical form, i.e., *пРЕПОДОВНАГО ДОМЕТИАНА ЕПИСКОПА МЕЛИТИНСКАГО*.⁹⁷ If the Kyiv printers had used the Moscow Tetraevangelion issued in 1685, they would have had to turn to another source in order to introduce the commemoration of Dometian, Bishop of Melitene, into the Menologion of the first Kyiv Gospel edition and to supplement it with liturgical information, corresponding to that in the Moscow Tetraevangelion of 1688, concerning the reading of the Gospel pericopes at Orthros and the Divine Liturgy on that day.

An analysis of the saints and feasts in the Menologia of Cyrillic early printed liturgical Tetraevangelia has made it possible to present the local liturgical tradition of Kyiv before 1720, which refers directly to Constantinople and indirectly to Jerusalem as well as to Alexandria, and is clearly reflected in the first two Tetraevangelia from the Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra printing house. The study of commemorations of saints attested only in the Kyiv Gospel editions issued in 1697 and 1712 offer new research perspectives. Their analysis can provide insight into the new liturgical relationships of Kyiv and Constantinople.

Numerous commemorations both present and omitted in the Menologia as well as textual variants and liturgical information prove the similarity between the first two Kyiv Tetraevangelia issued in 1697 and

⁹⁵ And in the Moscow Gospel edition issued in 1694, which was, however, excluded from the group of potential originals of the first two Kiev Tetraevangelia.

⁹⁶ This commemoration was also attested in three Kyiv small-format editions printed in 1737, 1752 and 1759. These three editions, however, omit the noun *епископа*.

⁹⁷ The 1681 Moscow Tetraevangelion has a *пРЕПОДОВНАГО* instead of *СВЯТАГО*.

1712 and the Moscow Gospel edition of 1688. This was the first issue of the Cyrillic early printed liturgical Tetraevangelion printed in Moscow after the transition of the Kyiv Metropolitanate from the Ecumenical Patriarchate to the jurisdiction of Moscow in 1686. With the first⁹⁸ liturgical Tetraevangelion prepared by the Kyiv-Pechersk printers and modelled on the Moscow edition of 1688, the year 1686 is rightly regarded as the beginning of Kyiv's gradual subordination to Moscow in the liturgical sphere as well, which was fully realised with the decrees of Tsar Peter I and the Most Holy Governing Synod introduced in 1720 and 1721.

Literature

- Âremenko, Maksym. 2017. *Pered vyklykamy unifikacii ta dyscyplinu-vannâ. Kyivs'ka pravoslavna metropoliâ u XVIII stoliti* (Kyivs'ke hrystyânstvo IV). L'viv: UKU.
- Bendza, Marian. 2006. „Inkorporacja metropolii kijowskiej do patriarchatu moskiewskiego.” W *Autokefalie Kościoła prawosławnego w Polsce*. Red. Antoni Mironowicz, Urszula Pawluczuk, Piotr Chomik, 65-114. Białystok: Uniwersytet w Białymstoku.
- Ćwikła, Leszek. 2006. *Polityka władz państwowych wobec Kościoła prawosławnego i ludności prawosławnej w Królestwie Polskim, Wielkim Księstwie Litewskim oraz Rzeczypospolitej Obojga Narodów w latach 1344–1795*. Lublin: Wydawnictwo Katolickiego Uniwersytetu Lubelskiego.
- Guseva, Aleksandra Alekseevna 2010. *Svod russkikh knig kirillovskoj pečati XVIII veka tipografij Moskvy i Sankt-Peterburga i universal'naâ metodika ih identifikacii*. Moskva: Indrik.

⁹⁸ The title page of the first Kyiv Tetraevangelion contains the following text: ἐν ᾧ αἱε (...) первое тѣпномъ изда са (...) ѿ воплощенiа же бгга слова, рдхѣуз, мiцса деисемврiа.

- Isaevič, Āroslav Dmitrevič. 2002. *Ukraïn'ske knygovydannâ: vytoky, rozvytok, problemy*. L'viv: Institut Ukrainoznastva imeni I. Krypâkevyča NAN Ukraïny.
- Kagamlyk, Svitlana. 2020. „How Moscow colonized Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra. New pages to the history of the Ukrainian printing of the second half of the XVIIIth century.” *ShidnoËvropijs'kij istoričnij visnik* 15: 54-64.
- Kaganov, Isak Ākovyč. 1959. *Ukrains'ka knyga kincâ XVI-XVII stolit'.* *Narysy z istorii knygy*. Harkiv: Knyžkova Palata URSS.
- Mironowicz, Antoni. 2006. „Metropolia kijowska w strukturze patriarchatu konstantynopolitańskiego (988–1685).” W *Autokefalie Kościoła prawosławnego w Polsce*. Red. Antoni Mironowicz, Urszula Pawluczuk, Piotr Chomik, 23-64. Białystok: Uniwersytet w Białymstoku.
- Morozov, Oleksandr. 2012. „Cerkovni starožitnosti v ekspoziciji Muzeû ridkisnoi knygy biblioteki Nižins'kogo deržavnogo universitetu imeni Mykoly Gogolâ: naprestol'ne Êvangielie 1689 r. z Nižyns'kogo Blagovišens'kogo monastyrà.” *Nižyns'ka Starovyna* 13 (16): 53-60.
- Ogiênko, Ivan. 1925. *Istoriâ ukraïns'kogo drukarstva*. Tom 1: *Istorično bibliografičnij oglâd ukraïns'kogo drukarstva XVI-XVIII v.v.* L'viv: Naukovê Tovarystvo Imeni Ševčenko.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2015. „Ewangelie czytane na wszelkâ potrzebê, rôznorodne w cyrylickich starych drukach tetraewangelii.” W *Zbrojne i ideologiczne konflikty w dawnym piŝmiennictwie Słowian i ich echa w nowszej kulturze* (Krakowsko-Wileńskie Studia Slawistyczne 11). Red. Marzanna Kuczyńska, Jan Stradomski, 105-120. Kraków: Scriptum.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2017a. „Ewangelie ot Marka v staropečatnyh izdaniâh četveroewangelij.” W *Slavânskaâ Bibliâ v èpohu rannego knigopečataniâ. K 510-letiu sozdaniâ biblejskogo sbornika Matfeâ Desâtogo*. Otv. red. Anatolij Alekseev, 357–367. Sankt-Peterburg: Institut

- russkoj literatury (Puškinskij Dom) RAN, Biblioteka Rossijskoj akademii nauk.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2017b. „Rozważania o genezie jedyneho cyrylickego starego druku ewangieliarza pełnego (Kijów, 1707 rok).” *Rocznik Teologiczny* 59 (3): 425-468.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2019. „Predisloviâ blažennoho Feofilakta Bolgarskogo k Evangeliiâm v kievskih Evangeliiâh tetr 1697 i 1712 gg.” W *Venec hvaleniâ. Studia ofiarowane profesorowi Aleksandrowi Naumowowi na jubileusz 70-lecia* (Latopisy Akademii Supraskiej 10). Red. Marzanna Kuczyńska, 115-126. Białystok: Fundacja Oikonomos.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2020. „Spisok glav Evangeliiâ v staropečatnyh kirilličeskich bogoslužebnyh Evangeliiâh tetr i ih otnošenie k rukopisnoj tradicii.” *Slavia. Časopis pro slovanskou filologii* 89 (2): 200-216.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2021a. „Oglavlenie Evangeliiâ ot Ioanna v staropečatnyh kirilličeskich bogoslužebnyh čtveroevangeliâh.” *Konstantínove listy* 14 (2): 109-125.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2021b. „Oglavleniâ Evangeliiâ ot Luki v staropečatnyh kirilličeskich bogoslužebnyh Evangeliiâh tetr. Tekstologičeskaâ harakteristika.” *Rocznik Teologiczny* 63 (1): 143-159.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2022a. „Rukopisnoe Evangelie-tetr RGB sobr. E.E. Egorova (f. No 98) No 139 i ego staropečatnyj original. Issledovanie mesâceslovyh pamâtei.” *Rocznik Teologiczny* 64 (2): 373-396.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2022b. „Klasyfikacija typologiczna Menologionów w cyrylickich starych drukach liturgicznych Ewangelii tetr.” W *Pol' za zelo velikaâ: sbornik naučnyh statej k 60-letiu Andreâ Vlagimiroviča Voznesenskogo*. Otv. red. Nikolai Viktorovič Nikolaiev, 41-48. Sankt-Peterburg: Rossijskaâ nacionalnaâ biblioteka.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2022c. „Staropečatnyj original rukopisnogo Evangeliiâ tetr RGB Ed. Post. no 59 (1735-1736 gg.). Tekstologičeskoie issledovanie mesâceslova.” W *Kompleksnaâ arheografiâ Moskovskogo*

- universiteta: sbornik naučnyh statei* (Trudy istoričeskoog fakul'teta MGU, Vyp. 208, Ser. II: Istoričeskie issledovaniâ 139). Red. Elena Vladimirovna Voroncova, Dar'â Aleskandrovna Sundukova, 181–197. Moskva: Arhiv RAN / Arheodoksiâ.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2023a. „Oryginał cyrylickich starych druków Ewangelii tetr wydanych w Poczajowie. Analiza świąt i świętych obecnych w menologionach.” *Slavistica Vilnensis* 68 (1): 10-23.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2023b. „The Early Printed Cyrillic Tetraevangelion issued in Vilnius/Vievis in 1644 and its source. Research into the Saints and Feasts present in the Menologia.” *Slavia* [w druku].
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy. 2023c. „Menologia of Cyrillic Early Printed Liturgical Tetraevangelia issued in Vilnius.” *Knygotyra* 80: 116-146.
- Ostapczuk, Jerzy, i Wiktor Wysoczański, Janusz Tadeusz Maciuszko, Jerzy Tofiluk. 2020. „Kratkie žitiâ Evangelistov v kirilličeskih staropečatnyh Evangeliah tetr i ih proishoždenie.” *Konstantínove Listy* 13 (1): 126-143.
- Polovnykova Svitlana Oleksandrivna, i Ihor Sytyj. 1998. *Kolekciâ kyrylyčnyh starodrukiv iz zibrannâ Černigiv'skogo istoryčnogo muzeû im. V. V. Tarnovs'kogo: Katalog* (Naukovo-dovidkovi vidannâ z istorii Ukraïni 44). Kyïv: In-t ukr. arheografii ta džereloznastva im. M.S. Gruševs'kogo NAN Ukraïny.
- Popov, Aleksei Vasil'evič. 2013. *Pravoslavnye russkie akafisty* (Liturgičeskaâ Biblioteka). Moskva: Izdatel'stvo Moskovskoi Patriarhii Russkoi Pravoslavnoi Cerkvi.
- Subtelny, Orest. 1980. „Russia and the Ukraine: The Difference that Peter I Made.” *The Russian Review* 39 (1): 1-17.
- Titov, Fedor Ivanovič. 1918a. *Tipografiâ Kyivo-Pečerskoj lavry. Istoričeskij očerk*. T. 1: 1606-1616-1721. Kyiv: Tipografiâ Kyivo-Pečerskoj Uspenskoj Lavry.
- Titov, Fedor Ivanovič. 1918b. *Priloženiâ k pervomu tomu Izsledovaniâ zaslužennogo Professora protoiereâ Feodora Titova: Tipografiâ*

- Kyivo-Pečerskoj Lavry. Istoričeskij očerk.* Kyiv: Tipografiâ Kyivo-Pečerskoj Uspenskoj Lavry.
- Ūrina, Lûdmyla. 2005. *Naprestol'ni Êvangelii XVI-XVIII stolit' u zibranni Nacional'nogo Kyêvo-Pečers'kogo istoryko-kul'turnogo zapovidnyka.* Katalog. Kyiv: KVIC.
- Zapasko, Akim Prohorovič, i Âroslav Dmitrevič Isaevič. 1981. *Pamâtniki knižnogo iskustva. Katalog staropečatnyh knig izdannyh na Ukraine.* Kniga 1 (1574-1700). L'vov: Viša Škola.
- Zernova, Antonina Sergeevna. 1958. *Knigi kirillovskoi pečati izdannye v Moskve v XVI-XVII vekah. Svodnyj katalog.* Moskva: Gos. ordena. Lenina B-ka SSSR. im. V.I. Lenina / Otdel redkih knig.
- Žurawińska, Zofia, i Zoja Jaroszewicz-Pieresławcew. 2004. *Katalog druków cyrylickich XV-XVIII wieku w zbiorach Biblioteki Narodowej.* Warszawa: Biblioteka Narodowa.

CHRZEŚCIJAŃSKA AKADEMIA TEOLOGICZNA
w WARSZAWIE

Rok LXV

Zeszyt 1

ROCZNIK TEOLOGICZNY

WARSZAWA 2023

REDAGUJE KOLEGIUM

dr hab. Jakub Sławik, prof. ChAT – redaktor naczelny

dr hab. Jerzy Ostapczuk, prof. ChAT – zastępca redaktora naczelnego

prof. dr hab. Tadeusz J. Zieliński

dr hab. Borys Przedpełski, prof. ChAT

dr hab. Jerzy Sojka, prof. ChAT – sekretarz redakcji

MIĘDZYNARODOWA RADA NAUKOWA

JE metropolita prof. dr hab. Sawa (Michał Hrycuniak), ChAT

bp prof. dr hab. Wiktor Wysoczański, ChAT

abp prof. dr hab. Jerzy Pańkowski, ChAT

bp prof. ucz. dr hab. Marcin Hintz, ChAT

prof. dr hab. Atanolij Aleksiejew, Państwowy Uniwersytet w Petersburgu

prof. dr Marcello Garzaniti, Uniwersytet we Florencji

prof. dr hab. Michael Meyer-Blanck, Uniwersytet w Bonn

prof. dr hab. Antoni Mironowicz, Uniwersytet w Białymstoku

prof. dr hab. Wiesław Przyczyna, Uniwersytet Papieski Jana Pawła II w Krakowie

prof. dr hab. Eugeniusz Sakowicz, Uniwersytet Kardynała Stefana Wyszyńskiego
w Warszawie

prof. dr hab. Tadeusz Stegner, Uniwersytet Gdański

prof. dr Urs von Arx, Uniwersytet w Bernie

prof. dr hab. Piotr Wilczek, Uniwersytet Warszawski

Redakcja językowa – Kalina Wojciechowska

Skład komputerowy – Jerzy Sojka

BWHEBB, BWHEBL, BWTRANS [Hebrew]; BWGRKL, BWGRKN, and BWGRKI [Greek]

PostScript® Type 1 and TrueType fonts Copyright ©1994-2013 BibleWorks, LLC.

All rights reserved. These Biblical Greek and Hebrew fonts are used with permission
and are from BibleWorks (www.bibleworks.com)

ISSN 0239-2550

eISSN: 2956-5685

Wydano nakładem

Wydawnictwa Naukowego ChAT

ul. Broniewskiego 48, 01-771 Warszawa, tel. +48 22 635-68-55

Objętość ark. wyd.: 10,7. Nakład: 100 egz.

Druk: druk-24h.com.pl

ul. Zwycięstwa 10, 15-703 Białystok

SPIS TREŚCI

ARTYKUŁY

JERZY OSTAPCZUK, <i>Cyrillic Early Printed Tetraevangelia issued in Kyiv in 1697 and 1712 – their liturgical tradition and original. Study of saints and feasts present in the menologia</i>	7
WOJCIECH SZCZERBA, <i>Knowing The Unknowable, Reaching The Unreachable. The Apophatic Theology of Gregory of Nyssa</i>	33
SŁAWOMIR ZATWARDNICKI, <i>Katolicka wersja sola Scriptura? Odpowiedź Josepha Ratzingera</i>	49
ANDREJ NIKULIN, ARTUR ALEKSIEJUK, <i>The Issue of Spiritual Revelations from the Perspective of Holy Scripture and the Traditions of the Church</i>	75
ELŻBIETA BYRTEK, <i>Geneza nauki konfirmacyjnej jako formy kształcenia konfesyjnego w tradycji protestanckiej</i>	93
СВЕТЛАНА ШУМИЛО, <i>Стилистическая фигура антитезы в древнерусских гомилетике и агиографии стиля плетение словес</i>	111
Wykaz autorów	128

Contents

Jerzy Ostapczuk, <i>Cyrillic Early Printed Tetraevangelia issued in Kyiv in 1697 and 1712 – their liturgical tradition and original. Study of saints and feasts present in the menologia</i>	7
Wojciech Szczerba, <i>Knowing The Unknowable, Reaching The Unreachable. The Apophatic Theology of Gregory of Nyssa</i>	33
Sławomir Zatwardnicki, <i>A Catholic Version of Sola Scriptura? An Answer of Joseph Ratzinger</i>	49
Andrej Nikulin, Artur Aleksiejuk, <i>The Issue of Spiritual Revelations from the Perspective of Holy Scripture and the Traditions of the Church</i>	75
Elżbieta Byrtek, <i>Genesis of Confirmation Work as a Form of Confessional Education in the Protestant Tradition</i>	93
SVETLANA SHUMILO, <i>Stylistic figure of antithesis in ancient Russian homiletics and hagiography of the weaving of words</i>	111
List of authors	128

Wykaz autorów

Jerzy Ostapczuk, j.ostapczuk@chat.edu.pl, Chrześcijańska Akademia Teologiczna w Warszawie, ul. Władysława Broniewskiego 48, 01-771 Warszawa

Wojciech Szčerba, w.szczcerba@ewst.edu.pl, ul. Św. Jadwigi 12, 50-266 Wrocław

Sławomir Zatwardnicki, zatwardnicki@gmail.com, ul. Czesława Miłosza 14, 57-100 Strzelin

Andrej Nikulin, andrej.nikulin@unipo.sk, Masarykova 15, 080 01 Prešov, Slovenská republika

Artur Aleksiejuk, a.aleksiejuk@chat.edu.pl, Chrześcijańska Akademia Teologiczna w Warszawie, ul. Władysława Broniewskiego 48, 01-771 Warszawa

Elżbieta Byrtek, e.byrtek@chat.edu.pl, Chrześcijańska Akademia Teologiczna w Warszawie, ul. Władysława Broniewskiego 48, 01-771 Warszawa

Svetlana Shumilo, shumilosm@gmai.com, Nacionalnyi Universitet „Chernihovskyi kolegium” im. T. Shevchenki, Chernigov, ul. Hetmana Polubotka 53, 14000 Ukraina.